

BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP

David Boies (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Alexander Boies (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 333 Main Street
 Armonk, NY 10504
 Tel.: (914) 749-8200
 dboies@bsfllp.com

Mark C. Mao, CA Bar No. 236165
 Beko Reblitz-Richardson, CA Bar No. 238027
 44 Montgomery St., 41st Floor
 San Francisco, CA 94104
 Tel.: (415) 293-6800
 mmao@bsfllp.com
 brichardson@bsfllp.com

James Lee (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 100 SE 2nd St., 28th Floor
 Miami, FL 33131
 Tel.: (305) 539-8400
 jlee@bsfllp.com

Alison L. Anderson, CA Bar No. 275334
 Samantha Parris, CA Bar No. 318681
 M. Logan Wright, CA Bar No. 349004
 2029 Century Park East, Suite 1520
 Los Angeles, CA 90067
 Tel.: (213) 995-5720
 alanderson@bsfllp.com
 sparrish@bsfllp.com
 mwright@bsfllp.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

Bill Carmody (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Shawn J. Rabin (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Steven M. Shepard (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Alexander P. Frawley (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Ryan Sila (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 One Manhattan West, 50th Floor
 New York, NY 10001
 Tel.: (212) 336-8330
 bcarmody@susmangodfrey.com
 srabin@susmangodfrey.com
 sshepard@susmangodfrey.com
 afrawley@susmangodfrey.com
 rsila@susmangodfrey.com

Amanda K. Bonn, CA Bar No. 270891
 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400
 Los Angeles, CA 90067
 Tel.: (310) 789-3100
 abonnn@susmangodfrey.com

MORGAN & MORGAN

John A. Yanchunis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Ryan J. McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)
 Michael F. Ram, CA Bar No. 104805
 201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor
 Tampa, FL 33602
 Tel.: (813) 223-5505
 jyanchunis@forthepeople.com
 rmcgee@forthepeople.com
 mram@forthepeople.com

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

ANIBAL RODRIGUEZ, SAL CATALDO,
 JULIAN SANTIAGO, and SUSAN LYNN
 HARVEY, individually and on behalf of all
 others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

GOOGLE LLC,
 Defendant.

Case No. 3:20-cv-04688-RS

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE SEEKING
 ADMISSION OF PX-4 IN THEIR
 REBUTTAL CASE**

Judge: Hon. Richard Seeborg
 Trial Date: August 18, 2025
 Courtroom: 3, 17th Floor

PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE SEEKING ADMISSION OF PX-4 IN THEIR REBUTTAL CASE

Google spent much of its defense case asserting that it intended to make its disclosures clear, and that there was no intent by Google to mislead users. *See, e.g.*, Trial Tr. 374:14-375:14 (Monsees); Trial Tr. 416:9-12 (Monsees); Trial Tr. 429:2-6 (Monsees); Trial Tr. 1155:14-17 (Ganem); Trial Tr. 1183:5-12 (Ganem); Trial Tr. 1375:2-1376:1 (Hoffman); Trial Tr. 1376:9-1377:13 (Hoffman); Trial Tr. 1381:10-24 (Hoffman); Trial Tr. 1385:22-1386:8 (Hoffman); Trial Tr. 1387:1-11 (Hoffman). In doing so, Google made PX-4 admissible evidence on rebuttal. As explained below, the “David” referred to in PX-4 is David Monsees. PX-4 should be admitted as relevant party admissions that are both admissible and highly relevant rebuttal evidence.

PX-4 is a 2016 Google email exchange stating that Google has been “*intentionally vague*” with its English language sWAA disclosures to users. The subject line for PX-4 is “Effect of flipping sWAA.” PX-4 includes a portion labeled “David’s comments” that first describes how “some of the *data for a user* was collected within their Google Account and some of it was collected *outside of their Google Account*” and then states: “*In English*, we’re *intentionally vague* because the technical details are complex and it could sound alarming to users” (In addition to this comment from “David”, the email concludes with a statement by Jens Mueller: “The English text is vague enough to not make this distinction clear.”) Mr. Miraglia, who received a copy of PX-4, testified about it in his deposition.

As Google admitted in its summary judgement reply brief, the “David” in this document was Mr. Monsees. *See* Dkt. 406 at 11 (discussing this document and stating “*Dave Monsees’* response was that WAA is described at a *level of technical vagueness so that it is accurate to users*”). Mr. Monsees agreed “the buck stops with” him with respect to how the WAA and sWAA controls are described to users. Trial Tr. 366:10-17. PX-4 on its face identifies Mr. Mueller as a Google Software Engineer. Mr. Miraglia also testified that Mr. Mueller was an engineer working on the “Consent Bump” project, which dealt with sWAA disclosures. Miraglia Tr. at 102:8-10. As such, Mr. Monsees and Mr. Mueller were both Google employees discussing Google’s English language disclosure to users, regarding sWAA-off data, and how those disclosures were

1 “intentionally vague” and “vague enough” to not make clear to users that Google would save data
2 *outside* their so-called Google Accounts.

3 While the Court originally ruled that PX-4 would not be admitted with the deposition clips
4 for Mr. Miraglia, that email exchange is now highly relevant as rebuttal evidence.

5 Because it contains admissions, PX-4 need not be admitted through a witness. However, if
6 the Court prefers that it be admitted through a witness, Plaintiffs can do so through minimal
7 additional Eric Miraglia deposition designations, who received PX-4 and whose deposition
8 testimony covered PX-4. The parties have already prepared designations and counter-designations
9 about Mr. Miraglia’s testimony on PX-4. There is no need to call Mr. Monsees back to testify
10 again. Google’s representation in its prior filing is sufficient to establish this statement embedded
11 in PX-4 as a party admission.

12
13 Dated: August 28, 2025

Respectfully Submitted,

14 By: /s/ Mark C. Mao

15 **BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP**

16 Mark C. Mao, CA Bar No. 236165

17 Beko Reblitz-Richardson, CA Bar No. 238027

18 44 Montgomery St., 41st Floor

19 San Francisco, CA 94104

20 Tel.: (415) 293-6800

21 mmao@bsfllp.com

22 brichardson@bsfllp.com

23 David Boies (admitted *pro hac vice*)

24 333 Main Street

25 Armonk, NY 10504

26 Tel.: (914) 749-8200

27 dboies@bsfllp.com

28 James Lee (admitted *pro hac vice*)

100 SE 2nd St., 28th Floor

Miami, FL 33131

Tel.: (305) 539-8400

jlee@bsfllp.com

Alison L. Anderson, CA Bar No. 275334

Samantha Parrish, CA Bar No. 318681

M. Logan Wright, CA Bar No. 349004

2029 Century Park East, Suite 1520

1 Los Angeles, CA 90067
2 Tel.: (213) 995-5720
3 alanderson@bsflfp.com
4 sparrish@bsflfp.com
5 mwright@bsflfp.com

SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

6 Bill Carmody (admitted *pro hac vice*)
7 Shawn J. Rabin (admitted *pro hac vice*)
8 Steven M. Shepard (admitted *pro hac vice*)
9 Alexander P. Frawley (admitted *pro hac vice*)
10 Ryan Sila (admitted *pro hac vice*)
11 One Manhattan West, 50th Floor
12 New York, NY 10001
13 Tel.: (212) 336-8330
14 bcarmody@susmangodfrey.com
15 srabin@susmangodfrey.com
16 sshepard@susmangodfrey.com
17 afrawley@susmangodfrey.com
18 rsila@susmangodfrey.com

19 Amanda K. Bonn, CA Bar No. 270891
20 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400
21 Los Angeles, CA 90067
22 Tel.: (310) 789-3100
23 abonnn@susmangodfrey.com

MORGAN & MORGAN

24 John A. Yanchunis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
25 Ryan J. McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)
26 Michael F. Ram, CA Bar No. 104805
27 201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor
28 Tampa, FL 33602
Tel.: (813) 223-5505
jyanchunis@forthepeople.com
rmcgee@forthepeople.com
mram@forthepeople.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs